

Islands of Influence
Jacobs, Hoffmann and Platt in New Zealand 1957.
© Marian Poole 2007.

Ten years after the formation of the National Orchestra and Lilburn's speech "In search of a Tradition"¹ at the inaugural Composers School, such post-colonial ventures towards professional music-making had lent New Zealand a sense of coming of age culturally speaking. While, as Lilburn had been at pains to emphasize, deciding what it meant to be a New Zealander was important, he and other leaders of New Zealand musical society also believed that keeping in touch with the homeland cultures was essential in order to advance along the most prestigious path. Unfortunately a generally dismissive attitude towards emerging New Zealand arts and artists allowed overseas opinions to gain higher authority.

Here I present the arguments of three men who as newly appointed experts represented the dominant strands of influence over a society gleaned from all corners of Europe and endeavouring to stand upright in the far flung islands of New Zealand. These three experts variously expressed their own cultural ties to Britain and Germanic Europe, at that time both maintaining something of a dominant position over culture. They therefore agreed in principle that it was necessary to appropriate European influences for the invention of something to stand for a uniquely New Zealand European culture. However, as Twentieth-Century Modernism mirrored the global disruptions of the first half of the Twentieth century to throw up a perhaps bewildering array of options, imperatives and claims, the debate gained a momentum of its own.

The first voice of authority here is Oxford graduate and then freelance writer on musicology, Arthur Jacobs. Jacobs' articles and opinions on music in New Zealand published by the *NZ Listener* made him almost a local identity. Before becoming a Professor of Music at London's Royal Academy, Jacobs was a music critic for the *London Daily Express*, acting editor for *Musical Times*. As a guest lecturer at Otago University in 1953 he had spoken about Vaughan Williams, William Walton, the English tradition and the next generation of English composers. Of previous articles published in *The New Zealand Listener* in 1953 and 1956, one gave two New Zealand music critics, Owen Jensen, founder of the Cambridge Composers' School and Dorothea Turner, who wrote articles about the National Orchestra for *Landfall*, at that time New Zealand's only literary magazine, something of an official stamp of approval. Jacobs' first of

¹ Douglas Lilburn: *In Search of Tradition*. Talk given at the first Cambridge Summer School of Music, January, 1946. Wellington, N.Z: Alexander Turnbull Library Endowment Trust : New Zealand Composers Foundation, 1984.

several musicological texts, *A New Dictionary of Music* is indicative of the purpose he had in 1957 for collecting information. His particular interests resulted in several publications on popular musical theatre and opera, Gilbert & Sullivan, Henry Wood, and British choral music.

Two of Jacobs' articles are of particular relevance here. One "Night Thoughts"², the name of the work by Humphrey Searle, addressed the French avant-garde "musique concrète" which as Jacobs pointed out, had put electronic music on the map. As such it was not to be confused with what he described as its "rival", the avant-garde electronic serialism of Stockhausen and Eimert addressed in his second article here "A Kind of Music"³.

The second voice of authority here is Richard Hoffmann. He had arrived in Auckland in 1935 with his parents as a Viennese refugee from Nazi Germany. Graduating from Auckland University under Prof Hollinrake, Hoffmann remembers the city primarily as a peaceful sanctuary in a visual paradise. In contrast to Vienna, then something of a cultural capital, he thought of Auckland as a cultural desert, woefully bereft of cultural opportunities and sorely in need of cultural stimulation⁴. In keeping with many of that generation and time including Lilburn and Jensen, colonial musical events of the nineteenth century had little relevance. In 1947 Hoffmann went to Los Angeles to archive his Uncle Arnold Schoenberg's papers in return for composition lessons. He was subsequently appointed Professor of Composition at Oberlin University where he continued to work towards a Memorial Institute for Schoenberg. In 1957 Hoffmann conducted a lecture tour of New Zealand Universities, which addressed issues concerning the Second Viennese School. He proposed to invite the NZBS National Orchestra to perform some of his own music and on the invitation of Freddy Page, the newly appointed inaugural Professor of Music at Victoria University, Wellington, who was particularly enamored with Germanic avant-garde, Hoffmann had intended to do a lecture tour of New Zealand universities, all with the purpose of promoting dodecaphony. This last proposal did not eventuate because of ill-health. However, he was interviewed for the New Zealand Broadcasting Service [NZBS], an interview which was subsequently published by the *New Zealand Listener*, under the editorship of Monte Holcroft, the author of several prize winning essays which promoted the possibility of an indigenous culture growing simply from habituation. The published interview drew attention firstly to Hoffmann's perspective of New Zealand's musical society and secondly to the performance stigmata associated with what Hoffmann deemed the most important

² Arthur Jacobs. "Night Thoughts" in *New Zealand Listener* 10 May, 1957. p5.

³ Arthur Jacobs "A New Kind of Music" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol37 No933. 28 June 1957. p5.

⁴ Private conversation with Hoffmann in Sept 2007.

new music.

The third voice of authority here is another Oxford graduate, Peter Platt. English-born, he had gained an Oxford BLitt, in 1957 succeeded Victor Galway (a graduate of Melbourne University) as Professor of Music at Otago University and subsequently took up the professorship at Sydney University. Platt's inaugural lecture, *Music as Living History*⁵ at Otago addressed the special difficulties facing New Zealand composers. He took a broadly polemic perspective which concurred to some extent with those of Lilburn. Platt drew on Vaughan Williams' thoughts on a "parlous"⁶ English tradition, his own knowledge of the wealth available in all music to inspire composers in remote yet kindred islands. Platt is remembered for rescuing Australian and New Zealand musicological societies from Euro-centricity.⁷

Jacobs:

As Arthur Jacobs points out, "Musique Concrète" had recently won recognition with a French radio opera and had become "highly developed" in Continental radio and with several commissions through the International Music Council. Humphrey Searle's electronic work "Night Thoughts" had been lauded, he told New Zealand readers, as "one of the finest compositions specially written for radio", here the BBC's "Third Programme" which proudly dedicated itself to meeting connoisseur tastes. It was above any concern about financial returns⁸. Having established musique concrète's credibility in Europe, Jacobs assumes with some justification, the need to know about it in New Zealand, and introduces it in perhaps uniquely New Zealand terms.

⁵ Peter Platt. "Music as Living History. An inaugural lecture delivered before the University of Otago on 20 September 1957." Dunedin: University of Otago Press, 1959.

⁶ R. Vaughan Williams *National Music* London: Oxford University Press, 1934.

⁷ John Philips: Eulogy to Peter Platt delivered at the Funeral, North Chapel and published in *Musicological Society of Australia* Newsletter No53 September 2000.

⁸ Robert Simpson, composer of tonal music and BBC producer with responsibility for the Third Programme from 4 years after its inception, said "I think the BBC at that time broadcast a wider spectrum of contemporary music than anywhere else in the world" and "in the days of the Third Programme just following the war - in the late 40s and early 50s (...) we had a real feeling of conviction about what we were doing, and we didn't consider how many people were listening. We considered, really, whether the thing we were doing was worth doing regardless of box office, regardless of financial considerations (...) we were (...) the envy of the whole broadcasting world". Interview with Bruce Duffie <http://bruceduffie.com/simpson.html> [accessed 11 October 2007].

Musique concrète, despite its name, has nothing to do with concrete mixers or mechanical equipment other than the fact that such sounds are likely to form its raw material. (...) There are possibly more unusual sounds to be heard now than ever before (...) [which] can be recorded accurately (...)

There is some resemblance to sound effects, especially in the early works, but the musique concrète technician goes beyond this to build up patterns and structures of sound.

Engineering found-sound, as Jacobs explains, allowed the technician to dramatically expand upon the full range of thematic and dynamic manipulations at conventional composers' disposal. The important distinction between the comparatively conventional structures of Searle's musique concrète and its rival was found in Stockhausen's and Eimert's purely clinical "artificial, electronic manufacture of sounds built up from a basic sine tone". However, all other concerns being equal, the Germanic and relatively unrecognized and as yet indeterminate "kind of music" offered an enticing scenario for the art music composer.

It sounds like the composer's dream, a kind of music that needs no performer, a kind of music that the composer himself builds up physically out of pure sounds, in such a way that the listener can hear it. Many a composer would be glad to banish the uncertainty, the capriciousness, [and] the intervention of personal temperament which the singer or instrumentalist brings when he performs music in the ordinary way (...).

While Jacobs had explained musique concrète's musical potential more than its technical demands, his description of the Germanic form highlighted the intricacies of manufacture and its avoidance of any human element. Stockhausen's exacting composition style was not an attempt at "ordinary music" but instead advanced on what had become a formulaic "ready-made" system already relegated to something of a traditional status.

Indeed, the Cologne composers recognize Schoenberg's revolution as history, almost pre-history. Their own starting-point is the music of Schoenberg's disciple, Anton Webern (...)
I [Jacobs] listened to these new sounds. To the moderately sophisticated listener the compositions seem like a mere conglomeration of buzzes, slidings and noises, but let me emphasize, this is not because the music is electronic, but because it is serial.

While electronic music could reproduce ordinary life and ordinary music, serialism worked on a more remote sphere. The removal of music from the risks and therefore excitement of live performance, as Jacobs described it, "that complex, social and psychological phenomenon" into a technical and mechanical realm had realistic implications for the future of radio. Serialism, however, removed electronic music further from the conventions of composition. But electronic serialism's claim on conventional and traditional purposes as concert music posed greater

complications, which Jacobs leaves up to conjecture. Given the lack of published response from Jacobs' readers in 1957, we might assume that they were equally bemused or simply disinterested. However, one year earlier, ARD Fairburn, a highly influential New Zealand writer, had worried over the "crisis of expressionism". Fairburn was concerned that the ageless interaction of artist and his society as argued by Herbert Read⁹ and from a different perspective by Adorno¹⁰, though apparently currently lacking in New Zealand, was threatened further by a twentieth-century "blight of aestheticism". On one hand the artist aimed to gain recognition as a "self-sufficient 'creator' ", while on the other hand the power of state funded cultural hegemonies such as the NZBS and New Zealand's National Orchestra endangered intuitive experiment in the Arts¹¹.

Hoffmann: "The New Music"

New Zealand audiences are sadly out of touch with the world of new music, according to Richard Hoffmann, formerly of Auckland, and now lecturer at Oberlin Conservatory (...). Mr Hoffmann claims that one reason for this is the unimaginative programmes given here by famous concert artists from overseas, who pamper New Zealand audiences by playing only the better-known classics. In America, he says, a new work is a 'must' at nearly every concert.

'Performers who come out here on their summer circuit cater for the local taste. They play what they know, what the audience knows, and what is easy. Their audiences are largely social ones, which they fear, may be scared away by new music.'¹²

Hoffmann used the same tone as had Schoenberg, Adorno and Eisler when talking about bourgeois concert audiences.¹³ Adorno argued that pure Art by definition remained above the comprehension of the masses. Therefore if any work gained popularity it had undermined its higher purpose and proper function. Commercial hegemonies, he argued, used mass culture cynically to control the proletariat. While New Zealand's cultural

⁹ Herbert Edward Read. *Art and Society* London: Faber & Faber, 1945.

¹⁰ Adorno, Theodor W. *The Culture Industry: Selected Essays on Mass Culture*. Edited and with an Introduction by J.M. Bernstein. London: Routledge, 2001.

¹¹ ARD Fairburn. "The Culture Industry" in *Landfall* 39: Vol 10 No3 September 1956. P198-211. P201.

¹² "The New Music" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol 37, No 940. 23 August 1957 p30-31.

¹³ Schoenberg letter to Mrs Elizabeth Sprague Coolidge. Benefactor the Arts and particularly music between 1910s and 1940s, 5 February 1937. in *Schoenberg: Letters* / selected and edited by Erwin Stein; translated from the original German by Eithne Wilkins and Ernst Kaiser. London: Faber and Faber, 1964. P200-2.

community was not necessarily aware of the analogy, Freddy Page, the newly appointed and inaugural Professor of Music at Victoria, supported that perspective with extraordinary vigor. New Zealand-born of English and Polish descent, Page was concerned that by and large, New Zealand composers, being reluctant to emulate Germanic avant-garde, therefore wrote to no great purpose. Page had been shocked that the National Orchestra refused to play Edwin Carr's dodecaphonic work, for example, because they found it unplayable. But Hoffmann's assumptions about New Zealanders' level of acculturation generated several months of debate through the *New Zealand Listener* "Letters" columns.

Turnovsky, a Czech refugee from Nazi Germany and Chairman of the Chamber Music Society, defended his subscribers and artists but without articulating any preference for modern music supported the notion that New Zealanders needed the sort of cultural improvement provided by Germanic Europe. LD Austin, who immigrated from Britain in the 1890's was known and often challenged on account of his conservative taste resided in Wellington and wrote a weekly feature "Thoughts on Music" for the Dunedin newspaper the Evening Star from the 1940s to the late 1960s. He believed with some justification that anything and everything created by the twentieth-century threatened the homogeneity and therefore the purity of European tradition. Marion Cleave, music student from Timaru was one who challenged Austin to join her quest and share her thirst for any news of overseas trends. Whether intent on preserving the past or acquiring the future, letter writers all expressed an anxiety about their isolation from prestigious culture and the need for New Zealanders to pursue a European rather than British heritage¹⁴.

But the *New Zealand Listener* was keen to distance itself from Hoffmann's declamations. Holcroft, a prize-winning essayist, had gained the editorship of this well-read weekly magazine at least in part by virtue of his faith that a genuine New Zealand culture would grow as a natural consequence of standing

¹⁴ Respondents included: CCG" Auckland. "The Musical Climate" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol36 No943, 6 September 1957. P11. F. Turnovsky President, NZ Federation of Chamber Music Societies. "The Musical Climate" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol37 No944, 13 September 1957. P11. Henry Walter (Wellington) "Snobbish on Principle" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol37 No944, 13 September 1957. P11. Written in response to a plea from Sarah Champion to respect and honour local high-achievers. LD Austin "The Musical Climate" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol36 No943, 6 September 1957. P11. Stewart Smith (Tauranga) Marion Cleave. "The Musical Climate" in *New Zealand Listener* Vol37 No945, 20 September 1957. P11. "Sebastian" Music columnist for the *Listener* Vol37 No944, 13 September 1957. P11. "Sebastian" was probably Nigel Eastgate who had won the Philip Neill award in 1954 with "*Prelude and Fugue for Organ*", under that pseudonym.

upright here¹⁵, and for his distrust of foreign “intelligentsia”.¹⁶ Holcroft encouraged New Zealanders to look to New Zealand’s landscape for inspiration. As Editor of the *New Zealand Listener*, a magazine of popularity unparalleled in New Zealand except perhaps by the *New Zealand Women’s Weekly*, Holcroft adopted a policy of paying critical attention to events important to New Zealand’s cultural identity.

By quoting Hoffmann at length, Holcroft revealed a polemic which threatened or shamed a mutually agreeable and successful arrangement between the New Zealand audience and its choice of performers. While Holcroft thought that Hoffmann’s imperative obstructed healthy parochialism, he did accept the necessity variously expressed by Cleave and Turnovsky of keeping a weather eye on overseas developments.

‘But’, said Mr Hoffmann, ‘new music is not a fad and New Zealand is a young country which should be receptive of new ideas. New music would be better understood if music appreciation, as taught, went a little further than Elgar’.

While the assumption that New Zealand housed a young culture and would therefore be an empty vessel might have given pause for thought in 1957, we can conclude that the “new ideas” Hoffmann alluded to were not those sounds of Sibelius, Elgar, Vaughan Williams or Bartók which resurrected a European tradition, or first peoples’ musics, but those which might have concurred with those of Shostakovich, Martin and of course Schoenberg which spoke of a disrupted heritage, despite the fact that all these composers were performed by the NZSO in the previous ten years¹⁷. Schoenberg’s “Transfigured Night” was played in 1951, as was Elgar’s *Dream of Gerontius* and Lilburn’s First Symphony, which was lauded as New Zealand’s true music by such respected critics as Jensen and Turner. Dag Wiren’s Third Symphony was performed in 1952 while Shostakovich’s First Symphony and Martin’s *Petite Symphony Concertante* were both performed in 1957. Composers working with various expressions of the folk idioms of so-called “late” Romanticism were performed on the basis that their works were appropriate firstly for the available orchestral forces, and secondly for an audience who naturally enough perhaps followed British and Continental conventions. 1957 was also the year in which the British prodigy, John Hopkins, was appointed¹⁸ against the BBC’s majority decision, as conductor of New Zealand’s National

¹⁵ A reference to the poet Glover’s expression of the difficulty of living on the other side of the world from cultural homelands.

¹⁶ Monte Holcroft, *Discovered Isles; A Trilogy, Deepening Stream, Waiting Hills, Encircling Seas*. Christchurch: Caxton Press, 1950.

¹⁷ Composers most performed by the NZSO between 1947 and 1957 were in order Sibelius (21 performances) Elgar (5) Vaughan Williams (4), Rimsky-Korsakov (4), Khachaturian (4) Bartok (4) Ravel (3), Lilburn (3) and Walton (3).

Orchestra. Local cultural leaders, including Turnovsky, had already shown themselves ready to take some risks. In this light, Hoffmann's sweeping attack on Elgar, the quintessentially British composer and New Zealand educational institutes which, excluding Victoria, were staffed by British immigrants, was the sort of condescension most likely to raise Holcroft's suspicions and therefore perhaps the beginnings of an indigenous defence.

Holcroft's article on Hoffmann devoted the next three paragraphs to substantiating Hoffmann's opinions. Details of his familial and professional proximity to Schoenberg precede another two paragraphs which detail the performance opportunities available to new music. Generally speaking, said Hoffmann, new music, perhaps Sibelius, Vaughan Williams and Bartok, is a "must" in American concerts, but as far as Hoffmann's new music, Schoenberg, Martin and perhaps Shostakovich, was concerned, support had its limitations.

Such well-established organizations as the New York Philharmonic Orchestra and the Metropolitan Opera are not allowed to depart from established ways in music, while most new music is not regarded by the major radio networks as a good commercial vehicle.

Despite their philanthropic veneer, sponsors of even the most prestigious organizations on the Eastern Sea Border were problematically governed by commercial value and therefore by a judicious approach to the attraction of aesthetic risk. Specialist societies, such as the Los Angeles "Evening on the Roof"¹⁹, Darmstadt and Ojay festivals and non-profit radio networks, which resembled the International Society for Contemporary Music [ISCM] in purpose, organization and audience, provided, according to Hoffmann, the only "strong support" for non-commercial challenge. A jaundiced accountant's eye might also have governed programming decisions made by the New Zealand National Orchestra. However, Hoffmann persevered with Schoenberg's argument.

The 12-note-system is merely a method of organizing music. All thematic material is derived from a basic shape – and there's nothing new in that. Schoenberg, for example, is a composer in the true German tradition, and his works follow in a logical line of development from the later compositions of Beethoven.

¹⁸ Joy Tonks. *The New Zealand Symphony Orchestra: The First Forty Years*. Auckland: Reed Methuen, 1986 "John Hopkins & The Golden Years"

¹⁹"Evening on the Roof" : So-called because performances were held in a refurbished suburban attic. The society is akin to ISCM and was inaugurated and operated on a volunteer basis by writer Peter Yates and his wife, pianist Frances. Borrowing expertise musicians from the Hollywood studio orchestras it performed such composers as Hindemith, Bartók, and occasionally Korngold, Schoenberg and Charles Ives. It continues to operate as a forum for modernist performances.

As Schoenberg said, new music is never beautiful. Only when we have it in our subconscious – when it becomes part of our flesh and blood – does it become an aesthetic pleasure.

Affiliating dodecaphony with the Great Tradition implied that youthful colonial societies merely dragged the chain by being unsympathetic to its idiom. However, as quoted, Hoffmann appears to admit that 12-tone-row avoided acquiescing to popular nineteenth-century ideas of aesthetic value as defined by Hanslick²⁰. Its distinction made it available only to those who had its language as embedded in their psyche as a national trait. Assuming the universality of that psyche obviated the sort of discussion which Jacobs had lent to electronic music or, as we shall see, the vision of distinct identity offered by Platt.

Platt 1957: Music as a Living History²¹

I now turn to a subject of vital importance for us in New Zealand. What does the study of music history teach the composer? First I would say, it reminds him that the aesthetic value of a work is independent of the age in which it was produced. As Professor Westrup has put it, 'a masterpiece is a masterpiece whenever it was written'. I am quite well aware that critics of literature and painting will consider these assertions self-evident.²²

While the achievements of the great masters, Bach, Beethoven and Brahms, might have eclipsed those of, for example, Byrd and Josquin du Pres, Platt drew on the support of his peers to encourage contemporary composers to draw upon ideas from all known history. Confining composition studies to Baroque and Romantic eras endorsed the idea that those times and those great men could not be surpassed and that combined they represented a logical conclusion for conventional materials. By de-emphasizing a Darwinian concept of cultural evolution, the progress of civilizations, Platt sidelined Hoffmann's and Schoenberg's argument which had come to dominate musicological thinking overseas and at Victoria University New Zealand. At Otago, Platt opened the door to new perspectives rather than new constructions.

In 1912 Vaughan Williams pointed the way so clearly to a solution of the problem that I wonder his words have not been framed in all musical establishments in those countries where there is no great tradition of composition. Talking of the

²⁰ Eduard Hanslick *The Beautiful in Music: A Contribution to the Revisal of Musical Aesthetics*. Translated by Gustav Cohen 7th rev ed, Leipzig 1888.

²¹ Peter Platt (Professor) *Music as a Living History* Dunedin: University of Otago Press, 1959.

²² Quoted from Westrup, *The Meaning of Musical History*. The Denecke Lecture for 1945, OUP, 1946.

parlous state of English music at that time, he demonstrates the necessity of turning away from European music, not out of perversity but because the great works of Europe were based on a tradition which simply was not in the Englishman's blood²³.

Leadership and inspiration as timely and perhaps as revolutionary as Schoenberg's, which reinvented traditional folk music, that is, the music of original peoples, had been successful for the contemporary composers represented in the New Zealand National Orchestra repertoire such as Vaughan Williams, Bartók, Stravinsky and Sibelius. Platt saw no point in undermining the status of the European Tradition as it applied to Europe, but two World Wars had disseminated European culture across the globe to places where its nationalism was up for renegotiation. Greater potential for the future lay in less than perfect even homely traditions.

In Britain and by association New Zealand, where music was at worst domestic, at best amateur and lacked a valued tradition, re-invention could only come from broader and historical perspectives. Here Platt agreed with New Zealanders Lilburn²⁴ and Holcroft²⁵ in believing that New Zealand was bereft of tradition. The folk music which survived transportation seemed to have become irrelevant on landfall²⁶. While Maori music had inspired New Zealand's first composer, Alfred Hill, Lilburn, also anointed as New Zealand's first composer, felt that borrowing this sort of other music was inappropriate. While local painters and writers, such as Rita Angus, Leo Bensemann, Allen Curnow, ARD Fairburn and Denis Glover were creating a unique voice even if it spoke predominantly of disenchantment,²⁷ the problem for Platt, Page and Hoffmann lay in New Zealand's isolation from living sources and the scarcity and low quality of music recordings. European tradition, Platt acquiesced, provided the only reliable "pedagogic instruction in the *techniques* of writing". However, for an island community remote from any influence except its own displaced or somewhat subjugated heritage, Germanic avant-garde as

²³ This quote comes either from a lecture or a private conversation, but is represented in Vaughan Williams' *National Music* Oxford University Press, 1934.

²⁴ Douglas Lilburn "A Search for Tradition" inaugural speech to the Cambridge Summer School for Composers, January 1946. Wellington: Alexander Turnbull Endowment Trust, 1984.

²⁵ Monte Holcroft, 1950.

²⁶ JM Thomson. *Distant Land. Lecture to Victoria University.* Victoria University Press, 1983.

²⁷ As were the painters, poets and writers Rita Angus, Leo Bensemann, Denis Glover, ARD Fairburn et al. Refer to Lawrence Jones, *Barbed Wire and Mirrors*. Dunedin: University of Otago, 1993.

advanced by Page and Hoffmann, provided Vaughan Williams and Platt with something to rally against.

The English composer is not and for many generations will not be anything as good as the great masters ... but is he for this reason of no value to his community? Is it not possible that he has something to say to his own country-men that no one at any age and any other country can say?²⁸

Parochialism in the face of Continental advances might have been as confirming of otherness in prewar England as it was in 1957 in New Zealand, when used to counteract Schoenberg's perhaps equally beleaguered solution. Platt drew simultaneously on the strength of a persisting tradition in New Zealand, coined by historian James Belich as the little Britain²⁹, and on the loss of a collective European identity. A new perspective rather than new materials would provide at least something indigenous.

Platt concludes:

For the student of human nature, of the arts, or of history, (...) the study of music should not be neglected. It is too much yet to expect every general historical or sociological work to include chapters on music. Yet there are signs that even this is coming³⁰

Platt's faith in a living history of music avoided the exclusive evolutionary premise which Hoffmann thought paramount and which Jacobs found intriguing, and therefore the notion that New Zealanders had a lot of catching up to do. It also put European music under something of an inclusive ethno-musicological light. Freed from European hierarchies, the New Zealand student, living in a "land without song"³¹ and searching for an expression of New Zealander / Pakeha identity had a whole unprejudiced world to choose from.

Platt drew an analogy from a British society's efforts to stand alone by circumventing the dialect of Germanic Europe which Page and Hoffmann embraced. Jacob's bemused observations supported European experiment but queried its musical dialect and its artistic place on the concert stage. Holcroft, by reproducing the European imperative revealed New Zealand as something of a cultural no-man's land stalled between arguments from Turnovsky, Austin, Cleave and Fairburn. Though Lilburn's first Symphony was widely recognized as a uniquely New Zealand, for some years after 1957, there was little unified commitment to his or Holcroft's faith in cultural development based on being an island apart.

²⁸ Vaughan Williams (1934)

²⁹ James Belich *Paradise Reforged: History of New Zealanders from the 1880s to the Year 2000*. Auckland: Penguin, 2001.

³⁰ Platt, 1959, P15.

³¹ Belich, 2001. "Land Without Song".

In summary, it would be wrong to give the impression that New Zealand had no composers who worked intuitively outside pedagogic circles or with any great concern for the issues here. The perspectives of these three men represent the dominant if not equally polemic forces behind New Zealand's quest for a solution to the perhaps uniquely mid-twentieth-century problem, that of the re-invention of European traditions in foreign lands, and in this case, a "Little Britain" peopled by immigrants with blood ties to all corners of Europe³².

The different musical idioms they presented continued to inform New Zealand's art music society until at least the early 1970s when the Nation started seeing herself culturally as well as geographically located in the Pacific. By arguing against participation in the South African Rugby Springbok Tour and the USA led Vietnam War, and by heaping accolades on Jenny McLeod's amateur opera "Earth, Sky & Sea" New Zealanders showed a nascent sense of indigenous pride.

³² While the cultures of the Chinese immigrants and the Maori remain significant contributors to the New Zealand identity, they did not form part of this discussion.